Table 1 Characteristics of EDC incentives over time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of firms</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>353</td>
<td>435</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>613</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total amount reported*</td>
<td>4,177,168,312</td>
<td>4,762,630,245</td>
<td>5,114,982,804</td>
<td>9,733,837,015</td>
<td>10,468,748,819</td>
<td>14,353,265,545</td>
<td>16,350,891,362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>per case average</td>
<td>15,357,236</td>
<td>14,654,247</td>
<td>13,115,341</td>
<td>19,864,974</td>
<td>20,252,836</td>
<td>25,449,052</td>
<td>28,635,537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job retention target</td>
<td>69,799</td>
<td>109,998</td>
<td>137,868</td>
<td>173,135</td>
<td>177,865</td>
<td>220,251</td>
<td>218,542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>per case average</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>564</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>544</td>
<td>578</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job creation target</td>
<td>11,766</td>
<td>34,303</td>
<td>35,646</td>
<td>78,584</td>
<td>81,918</td>
<td>94,897</td>
<td>92,422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>per case average</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>271</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jobs retained or created per $100k</td>
<td>19.64</td>
<td>46.43</td>
<td>58.31</td>
<td>56.16</td>
<td>52.29</td>
<td>42.30</td>
<td>39.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*total net present value of all contracts (not payable within same year).
** non-zero values only (i.e. only cases with known job targets are considered)

Table 2 Distribution of economic development incentives across industries in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIC industry division</th>
<th>Incentive amount ($)</th>
<th>% of total incentives</th>
<th>Industry % of NYC private employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>11,426,417</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>3.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>657,382,773</td>
<td>6.28</td>
<td>7.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation, Communication &amp; Public Utilities</td>
<td>3,706,467,940</td>
<td>35.40</td>
<td>6.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale Trade</td>
<td>198,808,085</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>5.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>76,252,402</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>13.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Insurance &amp; Real Estate</td>
<td>3,742,695,140</td>
<td>35.74</td>
<td>15.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>1,992,613,387</td>
<td>19.03</td>
<td>45.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclassified</td>
<td>85,070,000</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10,470,716,144</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3  Amounts of incentive packages and job targets (retained and created)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>24,557,667</td>
<td>11,426,417</td>
<td>313,426,417</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>2.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>307,866,880</td>
<td>657,382,773</td>
<td>2,186,788,142</td>
<td>6.28</td>
<td>6.30</td>
<td>14.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation, Communication &amp; Public Utilities</td>
<td>1,462,582,572</td>
<td>3,706,467,940</td>
<td>4,775,867,613</td>
<td>29.85</td>
<td>35.40</td>
<td>31.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale Trade</td>
<td>62,440,685</td>
<td>198,808,085</td>
<td>222,640,160</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>1.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>63,167,258</td>
<td>76,252,402</td>
<td>71,738,902</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Insurance &amp; Real Estate</td>
<td>970,779,005</td>
<td>1,992,613,387</td>
<td>2,570,588,419</td>
<td>19.81</td>
<td>19.01</td>
<td>17.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclassified</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>85,070,000</td>
<td>84,960,000</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4  Job targets (retained and created)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>1508</td>
<td>6447</td>
<td>8412</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>2.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>13986</td>
<td>19895</td>
<td>26294</td>
<td>13.29</td>
<td>7.71</td>
<td>8.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>75508</td>
<td>202484</td>
<td>241800</td>
<td>71.76</td>
<td>78.44</td>
<td>77.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>12036</td>
<td>20695</td>
<td>25791</td>
<td>11.44</td>
<td>8.02</td>
<td>8.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>2181</td>
<td>8618</td>
<td>8667</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>2.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5  Total amount of incentives received

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>67,219,850</td>
<td>272,098,522</td>
<td>519,447,022</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>3.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>1,222,394,938</td>
<td>1,185,766,727</td>
<td>1,581,571,790</td>
<td>29.26</td>
<td>11.32</td>
<td>9.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>1,930,889,251</td>
<td>7,505,647,638</td>
<td>11,165,231,331</td>
<td>46.22</td>
<td>71.68</td>
<td>68.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>793,206,773</td>
<td>1,296,396,120</td>
<td>2,804,538,083</td>
<td>18.99</td>
<td>12.38</td>
<td>17.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>163,457,500</td>
<td>211,116,636</td>
<td>280,103,136</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>1.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 6  Volume and number of incentive packages and jobs targets by borough and incentive program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>IDA</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>719</td>
<td>2776</td>
<td>3613</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>751</td>
<td>877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>8549</td>
<td>13480</td>
<td>15083</td>
<td>1247</td>
<td>1595</td>
<td>1689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>67065</td>
<td>11604</td>
<td>132430</td>
<td>7780</td>
<td>30068</td>
<td>28814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>9543</td>
<td>11810</td>
<td>10495</td>
<td>1388</td>
<td>2174</td>
<td>2727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>1906</td>
<td>7398</td>
<td>7427</td>
<td>1030</td>
<td>1030</td>
<td>1030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Sale</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>1030</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>1627</td>
<td>964</td>
<td>668</td>
<td>786</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>944</td>
<td>829</td>
<td>352</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lease/Straight Lease</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bronx</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>1025</td>
<td>1874</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>427</td>
<td>613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>1178</td>
<td>2,226</td>
<td>4149</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>574</td>
<td>3356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manhattan</td>
<td>126.2</td>
<td>1843</td>
<td>33572</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>41907</td>
<td>46328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>542</td>
<td>3889</td>
<td>6390</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1852</td>
<td>5351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* figures for 'straight lease' category only, amounts of 'lease' category missing
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year Deal Closed</th>
<th>Firms</th>
<th>Retention target</th>
<th>Creation target</th>
<th>Actual jobs (2003)</th>
<th>Actual jobs (long-run mean)</th>
<th>Subsidy Amount ($)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995 Firms</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>712.80</td>
<td>403.73</td>
<td>1117.67</td>
<td>960.5226</td>
<td>35462363.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>125.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>139.00</td>
<td>144.2500</td>
<td>4248916.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td>10692</td>
<td>6056</td>
<td>16765</td>
<td>14407.84</td>
<td>531935449</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26.13</td>
<td>1097000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>5000</td>
<td>5550</td>
<td>8321</td>
<td>5609.75</td>
<td>253925700</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996 Firms</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1242.89</td>
<td>235.22</td>
<td>1780.96</td>
<td>1688.7836</td>
<td>16615895.36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>319.50</td>
<td>31.00</td>
<td>404.50</td>
<td>279.5357</td>
<td>2555500.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td>34801</td>
<td>6351</td>
<td>49867</td>
<td>47285.94</td>
<td>465245070</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12.29</td>
<td>75784</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>5180</td>
<td>2500</td>
<td>10309</td>
<td>7561.57</td>
<td>157000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997 Firms</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>528.16</td>
<td>164.05</td>
<td>511.24</td>
<td>555.7585</td>
<td>8194034.08</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>88.00</td>
<td>31.00</td>
<td>112.00</td>
<td>104.0714</td>
<td>260000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td>20070</td>
<td>6070</td>
<td>19427</td>
<td>21118.82</td>
<td>311373295</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>16380</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>9639</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>7413</td>
<td>9389.83</td>
<td>910000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998 Firms</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>346.08</td>
<td>190.68</td>
<td>355.00</td>
<td>363.9540</td>
<td>10678365.65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>92.50</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>136.00</td>
<td>114.5167</td>
<td>21650000.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td>13843</td>
<td>7055</td>
<td>14200</td>
<td>14558.16</td>
<td>427134626</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14.40</td>
<td>1000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4010</td>
<td>2631</td>
<td>4068</td>
<td>4023.00</td>
<td>183000000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999 Firms</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>509.15</td>
<td>88.10</td>
<td>392.39</td>
<td>467.4449</td>
<td>12148720.24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>71.50</td>
<td>11.00</td>
<td>64.00</td>
<td>70.5500</td>
<td>23409950.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td>31567</td>
<td>5462</td>
<td>24328</td>
<td>28981.58</td>
<td>753220655</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td>150000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>13208</td>
<td>2735</td>
<td>5505</td>
<td>10006.20</td>
<td>500000000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>413.60</td>
<td>90.25</td>
<td>356.90</td>
<td>410.6094</td>
<td>10321484.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td></td>
<td>49.00</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>51.00</td>
<td>48.4167</td>
<td>2925000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td></td>
<td>19853</td>
<td>4332</td>
<td>17131</td>
<td>19709.25</td>
<td>495431236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td>460000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>7800</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>6396</td>
<td>8814.75</td>
<td>103500000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>493.98</td>
<td>99.42</td>
<td>369.13</td>
<td>371.5449</td>
<td>28233994.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td></td>
<td>89.50</td>
<td>15.00</td>
<td>81.00</td>
<td>73.0000</td>
<td>3523850.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td></td>
<td>25687</td>
<td>5170</td>
<td>19195</td>
<td>19320.33</td>
<td>1468167700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.50</td>
<td>544700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>14217</td>
<td>1880</td>
<td>8253</td>
<td>8287.00</td>
<td>538416000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>238.09</td>
<td>72.88</td>
<td>191.12</td>
<td>191.0588</td>
<td>28576930.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td></td>
<td>63.50</td>
<td>9.00</td>
<td>43.50</td>
<td>44.5000</td>
<td>4287500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td></td>
<td>8095</td>
<td>2478</td>
<td>6498</td>
<td>6496.00</td>
<td>971615645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5.50</td>
<td>472500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>1750</td>
<td>680</td>
<td>1870</td>
<td>1873.00</td>
<td>272671000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>209.77</td>
<td>156.54</td>
<td>209.62</td>
<td>209.6154</td>
<td>71647576.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td></td>
<td>49.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>59.00</td>
<td>59.0000</td>
<td>86550000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td></td>
<td>2727</td>
<td>2035</td>
<td>2725</td>
<td>2725.00</td>
<td>931418500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>1058500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>1790</td>
<td>1844</td>
<td>1847</td>
<td>1847.00</td>
<td>779600000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>325</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>507.08</td>
<td>138.49</td>
<td>515.56</td>
<td>529.0998</td>
<td>19259218.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td></td>
<td>81.00</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>87.50</td>
<td>87.5833</td>
<td>3031000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum</td>
<td></td>
<td>167335</td>
<td>45009</td>
<td>170136</td>
<td>174602.93</td>
<td>6355542176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td>16380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td></td>
<td>14217</td>
<td>5550</td>
<td>10309</td>
<td>10006.20</td>
<td>779600000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Only cases with valid records for jobs retained and actual jobs for the respective year are reported)
### Table 9 Mean annual change of jobs with valid year-to-year records (1995-2003) and job creation targets*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIC</th>
<th>Mean annual job change 1995-2003 (%)</th>
<th>Aggregate job creation target over entire period</th>
<th>Firms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>-28.29</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>43.84</td>
<td>8439</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation, Communication &amp; Public Utilities</td>
<td>883.63</td>
<td>7254</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>-16.67</td>
<td>726</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Insurance &amp; Real Estate</td>
<td>9.10</td>
<td>688.00</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>718.02</td>
<td>716.02</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2297.65</td>
<td>2297.65</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Valid cases only

### Table 10 Total job targets (retention and creation) and actual jobs (1995-2003)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIC</th>
<th>Total job creation and retention target</th>
<th>Actual jobs 2003</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>2713</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>-2610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>29799</td>
<td>24953</td>
<td>-4846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation, Communication &amp; Public Utilities</td>
<td>25243</td>
<td>27460</td>
<td>2217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>2084</td>
<td>1831</td>
<td>-253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Insurance &amp; Real Estate</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>779</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>57382</td>
<td>41886</td>
<td>16270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>181297</td>
<td>143184</td>
<td>38113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Valid cases only
Table 11 Total job targets (retention and creation) and actual jobs (1995-2003) at the SIC 2 digit level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIC</th>
<th>Forestry</th>
<th>Total job target</th>
<th>Actual jobs 2003</th>
<th>difference</th>
<th>Firms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>-5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>2713</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>-2610</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>638</td>
<td>1019</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>-36</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>-34</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>912</td>
<td>859</td>
<td>-53</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>-14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>1302</td>
<td>1018</td>
<td>-284</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>-29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>1094</td>
<td>886</td>
<td>-208</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>-15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>15015</td>
<td>12504</td>
<td>-2511</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>7304</td>
<td>5888</td>
<td>-1416</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>-11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>852</td>
<td>762</td>
<td>-90</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>-32</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>418</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>-82</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>786</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>-87</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>-134</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>431</td>
<td>524</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>-91</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>1005</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>-104</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>1375</td>
<td>1027</td>
<td>-348</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>-130</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>1154</td>
<td>640</td>
<td>-514</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>22862</td>
<td>25958</td>
<td>3096</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>1977</td>
<td>Change</td>
<td>Yr 1979/1977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>ELECTRIC  GAS &amp; SANITARY SERVICE</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>DURABLE GOODS</td>
<td>1343</td>
<td>1077</td>
<td>-266</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>NONDURABLE GOODS</td>
<td>2805</td>
<td>2750</td>
<td>-55</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>BUILDING MATLS. HARDWARE  GARDEN</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>-8</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>GENERAL MERCHANDISE</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-102</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>FOOD STORES</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>-125</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>FURNITURE  HOME FURNISHINGS</td>
<td>601</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>-286</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>EATING &amp; DRINKING</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>-35</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>MISCELLANEOUS RETAIL</td>
<td>864</td>
<td>816</td>
<td>-48</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>BANKING</td>
<td>5000</td>
<td>3983</td>
<td>-1017</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>CREDIT AGENCIES</td>
<td>586</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>-390</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>SECURITY &amp; COMMODITY BROKERS</td>
<td>21767</td>
<td>13922</td>
<td>-7845</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>INSURANCE CARRIERS</td>
<td>19880</td>
<td>14836</td>
<td>-5044</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>INSURANCE BROKERS</td>
<td>9989</td>
<td>8446</td>
<td>-1543</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>REAL ESTATE</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>HOLDING &amp; OTHER INVESTMENT COS.</td>
<td>4100</td>
<td>7484</td>
<td>3384</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>PERSONAL SERVICES</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>-68</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>BUSINESS SERVICES</td>
<td>9041</td>
<td>9941</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>AUTO REPAIR SERVICES &amp; GARAGES</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>MOTION PICTURES</td>
<td>7111</td>
<td>4282</td>
<td>-2829</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>AMUSEMENT &amp; RECREATION SERVICES</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>HEALTH SERVICES</td>
<td>1568</td>
<td>1387</td>
<td>-181</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>LEGAL SERVICES</td>
<td>31142</td>
<td>21124</td>
<td>-10018</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>EDUCATIONAL SERVICES</td>
<td>4670</td>
<td>4494</td>
<td>-176</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>SOCIAL SERVICES</td>
<td>1614</td>
<td>1254</td>
<td>-360</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>MUSEUMS GALLERIES GARDENS</td>
<td>3893</td>
<td>1841</td>
<td>-2052</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>MEMBERSHIP ORGANIZATIONS</td>
<td>1539</td>
<td>956</td>
<td>-583</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>ENGINEERING &amp; MANAGEMENT SERVICE</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>488</td>
<td>-102</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>UNCLASSIFIED ESTABLISHMENTS</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>-38</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>190967</td>
<td>156216</td>
<td>-34751</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 12 Difference between mean jobs to be created/retained and mean actual jobs reported

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Difference in means</th>
<th>Firms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>129.23</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>144.94</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>74.62</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>104.33</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>116.61</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>42.57</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>-10.87</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>-25.82</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13 Percentage of Companies not in compliance with job retention goals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>compliance</td>
<td>83.10</td>
<td>80.30</td>
<td>80.90</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>71.10</td>
<td>66.40</td>
<td>67.60</td>
<td>66.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>non-compliance</td>
<td>16.90</td>
<td>19.70</td>
<td>19.10</td>
<td>28.60</td>
<td>28.90</td>
<td>33.60</td>
<td>32.40</td>
<td>33.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firms</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1: Changes in Construction employment (SIC 3) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)
Figure 2: Changes in Manufacturing employment (SIC 4) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)
Figure 3: Changes in Transport, Communications, and Public Utility employment (SIC 5) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)
Figure 4: Changes in Wholesale Trade employment (SIC 6) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)
Figure 5: Changes in Retail employment (SIC 7) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)
Figure 7: Changes in Service employment (SIC 9) and incentive-receiving subset in New York City (1989=100)